

SCRUTINY BOARD (REGENERATION)

TUESDAY, 29TH NOVEMBER, 2011

PRESENT: Councillor J Procter in the Chair

Councillors B Atha, D Collins, P Ewens,
P Grahame, J Harper, M Iqbal, K Mitchell,
T Murray, R Pryke and G Wilkinson

Mr G Hall – Co-opted Member

37 Chair's Opening Remarks

The Chair welcomed everyone to the November meeting of the Scrutiny Board (Regeneration).

38 Exempt Information - Possible Exclusion of the Press and Public

RESOLVED – That this Board resolves not to accept the officers recommendation of possible exclusion of the press and public in respect of Appendix 5 to the report referred to in Minute 46 under the terms of Access to Information Procedure Rule 10.4 (3) on the grounds that it contained information relating to the financial or business affairs of any person or company and therefore requests that this document be released within the public domain with immediate effect.

39 Late Items

There were no formal late items of business to consider, however, the Chair agreed to accept the following supplementary item which was circulated at the meeting:-

- Formal comments of the Directors of City Development to the proposed interim recommendation of the Scrutiny Board (Agenda Item 10) (Minute 48 refers)

The document was not available at the time of the agenda despatch, but was made available on the Council's website immediately after the meeting.

40 Declarations of Interest

The following personal declaration of interests were made:-

- Councillor R Pryke in his capacity as a Board Member on East North East Homes ALMO (Agenda Item 7) (Minute 44 refers)
- Councillor G Wilkinson in his capacity as a Board Member on East North East Homes ALMO (Agenda Item 7) (Minute 44 refers)
- Councillor J Procter in his capacity as a Member of the Aire Valley Leeds Regeneration Board (Agenda Item 7) (Minute 44 refers)
- Councillor T Murray in his capacity as a Member of the Aire Valley Leeds Regeneration Board; Board Member on East North East Homes

ALMO and as Chief Executive of Learning Partnerships who were Members of the Chamber of Commerce (Agenda Item 7) (Minute 44 refers)

41 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes

An apology for absence was received on behalf of Councillor G Hussain.

Notification had been received for Councillor P Grahame to substitute for Councillor G Hussain.

42 Minutes of the Previous Meeting

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the meeting held on 31st October 2011 be confirmed as a correct record.

43 Matters Arising from the Minutes

Proposals to reform the process for the registration of land as town and village greens and to introduce Local Green Space Developments (Minute 34 refers)

The Chair informed the meeting that the Chief Executive on the advice of the Director of City Development had decided not to submit a late response to the consultation on the above issue based on the Open Space Society submission. Board Members had been provided with detailed reasons for this decision by the Director of City Development at their Pre-meeting.

Following a brief discussion, the Board requested the Principal Scrutiny Adviser to refer this issue to the Executive Board for consideration on the grounds that the original response/proposals made by officers was inadequate, ineffective and unreasonable.

44 East Leeds Regeneration Board

Referring to Minute 31 of the meeting held on 31st October 2011, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on progress made since the last meeting in relation to the East Leeds Regeneration Board.

Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Mr G Mudie MP; Gary Williamson, Chief Executive, Leeds, York and North Yorkshire Chamber and Councillor A Carter, Leader of the Conservative Group.

The Chair informed the meeting that Mr Williamson had stated that there was no benefit in the Chamber attending the Scrutiny Board meeting as they had no further information or knowledge on the issue and could not shed any further light on the commissioning of the papers.

The Board expressed it's concern towards this statement and reiterated that attendance at Scrutiny Board meetings was necessary. It was noted that the Chamber had been provided with a copy of forthcoming Scrutiny Board dates.

The Board was of the opinion that the scope and remit of the of the East Leeds Regeneration Board was too wide because of the number of projects being undertaken which includes Easel, Thorpe Park Business Park, East

Leeds Orbital Road, Vickers site etc. Members thought that many of these schemes were large enough in themselves to warrant separate reporting mechanisms rather than all reporting through the East Leeds Regeneration Board. It was therefore the view of the Board that the Head of Leeds Initiative and International Partnerships should be asked for a report on this issue for consideration by the Scrutiny Board.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report be noted.
- b) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to liaise with the Head of Leeds Initiative and International Partnerships with a view to a further report been considered on this issue at a future meeting of the Board.

45 Directors Response to Executive Board on the Recommendations of Scrutiny Board following its Inquiry on Housing Growth and on the Outcome of the Informal Consultation on this Issue

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report on the Directors response to Executive Board on the Recommendations of Scrutiny Board following its Inquiry on Housing Growth and on the Outcome of the Informal Consultation on this issue.

Appended to the report was a copy of the report of the Director of City Development entitled ' Director's Response to Report by Scrutiny Board Regeneration on Housing Growth – Executive Board – 2nd November 2011' for the information/comment of the meeting.

Specific discussion ensued on Recommendation 10 contained within the Executive Board report i.e. the proposal that 80% of the income raised through the Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) be ring fenced for the benefit of the local communities.

It was noted that the Government's consultation paper deadline in relation to the CIL issue was the end of December 2011.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to write to the Leader of Council, on behalf of the Board, recommending that the Director of Resources submit a response to the Government's consultation paper on CIL before consultation expires on 31st December 2011 supporting the view that a "meaningful" proportion of the levy to go to local communities should be 80% of the CIL income.

46 Leeds Bradford International Airport - Taxi Access

Referring to Minute 32 of the meeting held on 31st October 2011, the Director of City Development submitted a report on outstanding issues in relation to the taxi access at Leeds Bradford International Airport.

Appended to the report were copies of the following documents for the information/comment of the meeting:-

- Whitehouse Lane at Leeds Bradford International Airport – General Arrangement of Initial Option of a taxi rank (Appendix 1 refers)
- Initial Option (2010) for taxi rank on Whitehouse Lane adjacent to Leeds Bradford International Airport (Appendix 2 refers)
- Whitehouse Lane at Leeds Bradford International Airport – General Arrangement of Detailed Option for a taxi rank (Appendix 3 refers)
- Detailed Option for a taxi rank on Whitehouse Lane Adjacent to Leeds Bradford International Airport (Appendix 4 refers)
- Correspondence with Leeds Bradford International Airport (Appendix 5 refers)

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Board Members' queries and comments:-

- Gary Bartlett, Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation, City Development
- Andrew Hall, Acting Head of Transport Policy, City Development
- Oliver Priestley, Principal Engineer, City Development Department

The Chair invited the Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation and the Acting Head of Transport Policy to provide a background and detailed breakdown of the cost estimate and the design principles used, together with an explanation of the differences with the originally quoted estimate.

In addition to the above representation, the Principal Engineer also provided the meeting with a full explanation of the design principles in relation to both options (Appendix 2 and 3 refers).

Detailed discussion ensued on the contents of the report and appendices.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Chief Officer, Highways and Transportation, City Development be requested to prepare a further report for consideration at the next meeting of the Scrutiny Board providing details of the advice and guidance that was received by the new Engineering Support team for the revised scheme proposed for Whitehouse Lane which justified the higher standard of road proposed for a taxi rank when the road itself was unclassified (Appendix 3 refers)
- c) That officers be asked to confirm that there was no relevant correspondence with the LBIA between the period 8th April 2011- 25th July 2011.
- d) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to update the work schedule accordingly.

(Councillor M Iqbal joined the meeting at 10.45am during discussions of the above item)

47 **Kirkgate Market - Additional Information**

Referring to Minute 33 of the meeting held on 31st October 2011, the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development on additional information provided in relation to Kirkgate Market.

Appended to the report was a copy of a report prepared by the Director of City Development on the provision of additional information on lettings, Leeds Kirkgate Market for the information/comment of the meeting.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Members' queries and comments:-

- Cath Follin, Head of City Centre and Markets, City Development
- Parveen Ahmad, Commercial Development Manager, City Development
- Liz Laughton, Chair of National Markets Traders' Federation (NMTF) Leeds (Kirkgate Branch)
- Jo Williams, Consultant, Leeds Markets (Kirkgate Branch)
- Michele Hocken, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)
- Lacky Singh, National Market Traders' Federation (NMTF) (Kirkgate Branch)

Prior to discussing the report, the Chair informed the meeting that following a recent briefing with the Head of City Centre and Markets and the Markets Manager with regards to rents of different stalls, he was satisfied that there was a rationale being applied at the market. However he was of the opinion that the system was very complex and that there was now merit in making the process much simpler.

The Head of City Centre and Markets responded and gave the Board the assurances that this issue would be addressed through any future changes in the ownership and management of the market.

In summary, Board Members made specific reference to the following issues:-

- a request for the Board to receive a copy of Kirkgate Markets Forum minutes on a regular basis
(The Head of City Centre and Markets responded that there had only been one meeting of the Forum recently. A note of these meetings in the future would be circulated to all Members of the Scrutiny Board via the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser)
- a proposal that the Board, including new Members visit the market
(The Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser responded and agreed to arrange a visit in due course)
- clarification of whether vacant stalls increase the service charges to tenants at the market and the loss of income from vacant stalls for the years specified in the schedule.
(The Head of City Centre and Markets agreed to supply this information to a future meeting)

- the need for clarification in relation to a list of vacant stalls which had been released to the market traders which differed from the list provided to the Board.
(*The Head of City Centre and Markets responded and agreed to confirm that the list submitted to the Board was correct or provide Members with an amended copy*)
- clarification of when the consultants report would be available for the Scrutiny Board to see prior to consideration by the Executive Board
(*The Head of City Centre and Markets responded and informed the meeting that it was on the Forward Plan to go to Executive Board in February 2012*)

In addition to Board Members comments, the Chair also gave the Market trader representatives an opportunity of asking specific questions or seeking clarification of the points raised which were duly noted by the Board.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.
- b) That the Head of City Centre and Markets be requested to submit a further report to the Board setting out the affect vacant stalls have on the service charges applied to stallholders and on the total estimated loss of income from vacant units listed in the appendix submitted to the Board for the years specified.
(*At the request of the Board, the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser agreed to consult with the Chief Officer the report author, with a view to it being considered at the Board meeting on 17th January 2012*)
- c) That a draft copy of the Consultant's report be submitted to this Board on 17th January 2012 and that the Chief Officer Public Private Partnership Unit who was leading on this project be invited to this meeting.
- d) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to update the Board's work schedule.

(Councillor B Atha left the meeting at 12.45pm during discussions of the above item)

(Councillor K Mitchell left the meeting at 12.50pm during discussions of the above item)

(Councillor M Iqbal left the meeting at 12.55pm during discussions of the above item)

48 Inquiry to Consider Affordable Housing by Private Developers - Interim Recommendation to Executive Board

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report in relation to Board's Inquiry on the provision of affordable housing by private developers in the city.

A copy of the formal comments of the Directors of City Development to the Board's proposed recommendation were tabled as supplementary information at the meeting.

The Board was asked having regard to the Director's formal comments whether it wished to agree an interim recommendation to the Executive Board in that it reconsiders this interim housing policy as a matter of urgency with a view to reinstating the 2008 affordable housing targets in relation to Greenfield sites.

The following representatives were in attendance and responded to Members' queries and comments:-

- Martin Sellens, Head of Planning Services, City Development
- Robin Coghlan, City Development
- Maggie Gjessing, Housing Investment Manager, Environment and Neighbourhoods

Prior to discussing this issue, the Board raised their concerns of the non attendance of the Chief Planning Officer and the Deputy Chief Officer Planning Officer at today's meeting. Martin Sellens, Head of Planning Services responded and agreed to convey the Board's comments to Mr Crabtree and Mr Speak.

Detailed discussion ensued on the contents of the report and appendices.

It was the general consensus of the meeting that despite the formal comments received from officers, the Board's recommendations should stand and be presented to Executive Board for consideration.

RESOLVED –

- a) That the contents of the report and comments of the Director of City Development to the proposed interim recommendation be noted.
- b) That approval be given to an interim recommendation to the Executive Board in that it reconsiders the interim housing policy as a matter of urgency with a view to reinstating the 2008 affordable housing targets in relation to Greenfield sites.

(Councillor J Harper left the meeting at 1.15pm during discussions of the above item)

49 Work Schedule

The Head of Scrutiny and Member Development submitted a report providing Members with a copy of the Board's current draft work schedule. The Executive Board minutes of 2nd November 2011, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1st November 2011 to 29th February 2012 were also attached to the report.

RESOLVED-

- a) That the contents of the report and appendices be noted.

Draft minutes to be approved at the meeting
to be held on Monday, 19th December, 2011

- b) That the Executive Board minutes of 2nd November 2011, together with the Forward Plan of Key Decisions for the period 1st November 2011 to 29th February 2012 be noted.
- c) That the Board's Principal Scrutiny Adviser be requested to revise the work schedule to incorporate the recommendations made at today's Board meeting.

50 Date and Time of Next Meeting

Monday 19th December 2011 at 10.00am in the Civic Hall, Leeds (Pre-meeting for Board Members at 9.30am)

(The meeting concluded at 1.20pm)